

# Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes

## April 11, 2016

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET on April 11, 2016.

### Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)  
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)  
Ira McDonald (High North)  
William Wagner (TIC)  
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

### Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
  - IP policy accepted, Smith taking minutes
2. Review previous minutes:
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20160404.pdf>
  - Approved as posted
3. Status (Ira / Mike)
  - IPP Everywhere Self Certification
    - Site is live!
    - Any printers submitted?
      - Mike said he was going to curate some of the first submissions
      - Page (<https://www.pwg.org/printers>) seems to be not live / 404 - website malfunction or no printers submitted and curated?
    - Action: Smith to ask Mike for status on the printers list, and how notification works when submissions have been made and/or new printers are added to the list
  - RFC 2910bis / RFC 2911bis
    - Smith (HP) had updates or feedback on both of these; some discussion on the reflector
    - Action: Mike to update 2910bis / 2911bis and post notice to IPP WG reflector
  - IPP 3D Printing Extensions
    - Mike planning on a fresh draft for April F2F
  - IPP Finishings 2.1
    - First draft posted 2016-04-11 (today)
  - "document-format" inconsistent with "document-format-details" / "document-format"
    - Thread on mailing list

- Conclusion:
  - If any of "client-error-attributes-or-values-not-supported" or "
  - Action: Mike to update 2911bis to say "SHOULD NOT return 'successful-ok-ignored-or-substituted-attributes' when there are attributes whose values should be identical but are not, and SHOULD instead return 'client-error-attributes-or-values-not-supported' or something similarly appropriate, and generally SHOULD NOT return any of the 'successful-ok-XXX' ..."
- 4. Review of IPP Finishings 2.1 (Smith)
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings21-20160411-rev.pdf>
  - "measured" --> "determined"
  - removed sentence from 5.2.11
  - add to 5.2.11.3: 'The "punching-offset" member attribute specifies the distance from the center of the hole to the reference edge...'
  - make the equivalent changes in 5.2.11 in 5.2.12
  - 5.2.12.1
    - simplify to whole degrees
    - discuss rotation relative to reference edge
    - switch to clockwise for the rotation because nobody does it counterclockwise
  - Add the new attributes and collection member attributes to the IANA registration section of the document
  - Action: Smith to post updated draft of Finishings 2.1 before F2F
- 5. Review of Canon proposals for addition (Rick)
  - <http://www.pwg.org/pipermail/ipp/2016/018753.html>
  - Multi-punch
    - add new keywords for multi-hole punching, and define "punching-number" (perhaps "punch-count" instead) for the number of holes to make
    - why not use finishings-col "punching-locations" instead?
    - Discuss at F2F
  - password for job-account-id?
    - job-account-id is sort of a "shared user account" that is distinct (or can be) from the "job-owner" or "requesting-user-name"
    - adding a "job-account-password" will trigger the need for a number of related attributes - clones of all the ones that relate to "job-password"
    - Joe Murdoch had discussed creating a "security token" like for instance "identity-col"
    - All to meditate on this and discuss at the F2F
- 6. Review of IPP System Service (Ira / Mike)
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20160228-rev.pdf>
  - Punting till F2F

## Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP F2F meetings April 27, 2016 at 1pm MT and April 28, 2016 at 9am MT
- Next IPP conference calls May 9, 2016 at 3pm ET and May 16, 2016 at 4pm ET (3D)
- Action: Smith to ask Mike for status on the printers list, and how notification works when submissions have been made and/or new printers are added to the list
- Action: Mike to update 2910bis / 2911bis and post notice to IPP WG reflector
- Action: Mike to update 2911bis to say "SHOULD NOT return 'successful-ok-ignored-or-substituted-attributes' when there are attributes whose values should be identical but are not, and SHOULD instead return 'client-error-attributes-or-values-not-supported' or something similarly appropriate, and generally SHOULD NOT return any of the 'successful-ok-XXX' ..."
- Action: Smith to post updated draft of Finishings 2.1 before F2F
- Action: Mike to post updated WD template with boilerplate "operating system providers" fixed (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to fix \*-k-octets in IANA IPP registry - should be Status attributes (PENDING - do this with the Job Password Repertoire registrations)