

# Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes December 7, 2015

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET December 7, 2015.

## Attendees

# Smith Kennedy (HP)  
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)  
Ira McDonald (High North)  
Mike Sweet (Apple)  
Paul Tykodi (TCS)  
William Wagner (TIC)  
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

## Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
  - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Approve IPP minutes from previous meeting
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20151116.pdf>
  - Approved as posted.
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike/Smith)
  - IPP 2.0, 2.1, 2.2 (Mike/Ira)
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/standards/std-ipp20-20151030-5100.12.pdf>
    - PWG Standard 5100.12-2015
    - First PWG Standard / IEEE Standard !!!
      - to be published (free) in IEEE catalog
    - Schedule - Smith/Mike to follow up with IEEE-ISTO folks
  - IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification (SELCERT) (Mike)
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20151110-rev.pdf>
    - Stable draft - with new PWG process updates
    - Schedule - PWG Last Call ends December 18, 2015
    - Have 4 of 9 responses needed for quorum so far
  - IPP WG Charter (Mike)
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipp-charter-20151119.pdf>
    - Adds IPP 3D Printing Extensions as a project
    - PWG Formal Vote started on 11/25/15 - ends on 12/25/15
    - Schedule - announce in January 2016
4. NodeJS IPP Client released (Smith)
  - <https://github.com/williamkapke/ipp>
  - Good news for IPP adoption!
5. IPP Staple and Punch Origins/Angles/Dimensions (Smith/Ira/Mike)

- <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2015/018651.html>
  - Off-list discussion on 11/06/15 to 11/09/15 started by Smith
  - Potential errata update to IPP Finishings 2.0 based on JDF attributes
  - Mike/Ira to review JDF attributes and propose IPP extensions
6. Review of IPP Job Password Repertoire (Smith)
- <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wp-job-password-repertoire-20151128-rev.pdf>
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2015/018661.html>
  - Reviewed by IPP WG on 10/19/15
  - Plan is to register stand-alone (without enclosing IPP spec)
  - Schedule - IPP WG review and IANA registration in Q4 2015 / Q1 2016
  - Q: job-password-minimum-length (integer(0:255)) OR job-password-input-supported (rangeOfInteger)
    - job-password-supported is maximum octets prior to hashing
    - No existing IPP attributes specify character limits - everything is octets (regardless of charset)
    - Purpose of job-password-input-supported was to limit based on characters that the Printer can support on its control panel/console
    - "input" is somewhat vague, "chars" might be confused with a list of allowed characters
    - A: We want job-password-input-supported (maybe change the name)
    - Character set is defined by job-password-repertoire-configured value - UTF-8 conforms to Network Unicode (RFC 5198), us-ascii
    - Use "job-password-length-supported (rangeOfInteger(0:255))", length of password in characters
  - Section 4.2:
    - "keywors" -> "keywords"
    - "Nework" -> "Network"
  - Table 1:
    - Drop "iana\_utf-8\_complex"
  - Section 7:
    - Copy boilerplate from IPP INFRA security considerations, add something about using TLS for protection of job-password value in transit
7. Review of IETF IPP/1.1 Updates (Mike/Ira)
- <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2910bis-06.txt>
  - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis-05.txt>
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2015/018665.html>
  - Changes for new IETF Proposed Standard
  - Barry Leiba (IETF ART AD) will be AD sponsor - note on 07/12/15
  - 2911bis reviewed by IPP WG on 11/16/15
  - 2910bis review today
  - Schedule - IETF Last Call in Q1/Q2 2016
  - Section 1.1:
    - "IPPP" -> "IPP"
  - Global:

- Drop 2911 references after "Model"
- Section 4:
  - Drop note about non-conforming HTTP implementations
- 8. Review of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20151206-rev.pdf>
  - Interim draft - need to add operation and attribute details
  - Reviewed by IPP WG on 10/05/15 - stopped at section 7.2
  - Schedule - Prototype draft in Q1/Q2 2016
  - Section 6.27:
    - Drop reference to Startup-Printer operation in RFC 3998
    - Move last sentence in the first paragraph after the second paragraph, talk about roll-up and include forward reference to system-state definition.
    - Need to talk about what happens to a Printer that is already started
      - restart?
        - Doing a restart of already started Printers seems wrong/unintuitive
    - Drop Restart-One-Printer operation
      - If the Printer is so messed up that it doesn't handle Restart-Printer (RFC3998), then admin can send Shutdown-One-Printer to system server and then Startup-One-Printer
      - "Unnecessary compound operation"
  - Need to clearly define startup/shutdown/restart semantics
  - Q: Keep Restart-All-Printers?
    - A: No, just have Shutdown-All-Printers and Startup-All-Printers
    - Have Pause-All-Printers-After-Current-Job
  - Global: Drop references after attribute names in requests and responses
  - Add tables of attributes that are required/recommended in the attributes sections that provide references to external specs or sections within the document
  - Section 6.27.2:
    - Swap attributes-charset/attributes-natural-language with status-message/detailed-status-message
    - status-code isn't a type2 enum attribute, it is a parameter; see the following for example text (although I think I'll swap the status message and natural language paragraphs for the next draft):
      - <https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis-05#page-38>
  - Only reviewed Sections 6.27.x

## Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls January 4, 2016 at 3pm ET and January 11, 2016 at 4pm ET (tentative for 3D)
- Continue review of RFC2910bis and RFC2911bis
- Continue discussion and scoping of System Service operations and attributes
- Action: Mike to start PWG Last Call of Self-Cert (DONE)

- Action: Mike to post stable draft of IPP charter with changes since the last charter (DONE)
- Action: Mike to send Ira an update of the IANA IPP registry (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post updated drafts of RFC2910bis and RFC2911bis (RFC2910bis DONE, RFC2911bis PENDING)
- Action: Everyone to post their list of user operations for the system service to the IPP WG list (PENDING)