Internet Printing Project Meeting Minutes
November 7,8 1996
New Orleans, Louisiana

The meeting started on November 7, 1996 at 1:30PM. The attendees were the same as the PWG and PMP sessions of this meeting and were:

JK Martin - Underscore
Ron Bergman - Data Products
Lloyd Young - Lexmark
Lee Farrell - Canon
Don Wright - Lexmark
Andy Davidson - Tektronix
Rick Landau - Digital
Randy Turner - Sharp
David Kellerman - Northlake Software
David Roach - Unisys
Mike Timperman - Lexmark
Rob Whittle - Novell
Chris Wellens - Interworking Labs
Scott Isaacson - Novell
Bob Setterbo - Adobe
Mabry Dozier - QMS
Pete Loya - HP
Bob Pentecost - HP
Tom Hastings - Xerox
Harry Lewis - IBM
Roger Debry - IBM
William Wagner - Digital Products
Atsushi Yuki - Kyocera
Rob Rhoads - Intel
Robert Herriot - Sun
Jeff Barnett - IBM
Carl-Uno Manros - Xerox
Keith Carter - IBM
Jim Walker - Dazel

The meeting started with a discussion of the charter proposal made by Scott Isaacson. While there were a number of issues with the wording the group agreed by acclamation to the starting of the project. The following were identified as the “leaders” of the project:

Chair: Carl Manros - Xerox
Editor: Scott Isaacson - Novell
Don Wright: Secretary

Harry Lewis presented material on the Salutation Consortium. This presentation is available on the PWG server in the ipp directory (pub/pwg/ipp/salutation/Salut.ps).

An issue was raised as to whether because the Salutation protocol is done by an organization that charges for participation would that be a problem for the IETF? Will they release the copyright?

Because the level of the material presented was not in depth, the group was concerned that they were unable to make any kind of technical evaluation of the Salutation Consortium's protocol.

Jeff Barnett of the IBM Internet Division presented his material entitled "Internet Print Protocol Proposal" which is available on the ftp server as netprint/overview.ps and .pre. The IBM proposal is based on using something like HTTP to transport print files from the client to the printer through a server via both a push and a pull methodology.

Scott Isaacson presented a lightweight document print application that could be used for internet printing. Scott's material is available in the pub/pwg/ipp/ldpa directory on the ftp server. It was pointed out that the proposal did not include the actual document transfer method. Everyone agreed that this was needed. Checkpointing the sending of a large document was discussed. Next, Scott presented "An LDPA URL Format" which describes how to point to a printer with a URL.

Dave Kellerman brought up the issue of a perspective that DPA has been less than a success. Is that the right basis to build upon? Have we learned that DPA is too complex and that only a reduced, lightweight implementation will achieve any degree of interoperability?

A discussion ensued centered on whether there is a clear consensus on what the problem is. The definition was assigned to a subcommittee which will meet later in the evening.

The meeting adjourned at 6:15 PM

At 8:15PM a subcommittee of the PWG group meet to pull together a statement of the problem to be solved. That group consisted of :

Roger Debry
Harry Lewis
Tom Hasting
Bob Herriot
Keith Carter
Scott Isaacson
Carl-Uno Manros
Jim Walker

Don Wright
Rob Whittle

A charter was developed including the subcommittee's statement of the problem and customer wants and needs. Additionally the charter included a schedule. The subcommittee created other small groups to pull together the pieces of the proposal including:

1) The subset of the DPA attributes to be used as job and printer attributes
2) Schemas
3) Service Location protocol or LDAP mappings

The subcommittee recessed at 10:45 PM.

The meeting resumed at 8:00 AM Friday, November 8th with the whole PWG group present to review the results of the sub-committee.

- Mailing list will be ipp@pwg.org. Information on how to join will be sent to the PWG mailing list.

- Scott Issacson presented the outline of the problems and customer wants and needs for internet printing largely from a user perspective with minimal operator and administrator content. This was the Charter V2.0. Charter V3.0 which includes comments and revisions from the review will be posted by Scott Isaacson to the ftp server by Monday, November 11th.

Carl reviewed the schedule, work plans, etc. to achieve an internet draft before the December IETF meeting. The goal is to have a BOF at the December IETF. Carl will provide the details as they are finalized and we will distribute them to the various mailing lists. The group will drive to be chartered as a working group shortly after the December meeting.

We will use the proposed charter as posted by Scott Isaacson as the charter for the IETF. Novell will assign a person to create a home page and work with Underscore to have it setup on the PWG.ORG machine. Additionally, the "netprint" directory on the ftp server will be renamed to "ipp".

Roger Debry will contact Netscape and Don Wright will contact Microsoft in an attempt to get them to participate in this effort.

A series of telephone conference calls will be held on Wednesdays at 4PM Eastern. The first call will be Wednesday Nov 13th. The phone number for that call is 423-544-0905, access code 114698.

Harry Lewis reported that the Salutation Consortium would be willing to work with the IPP team to make the Salutation protocol part of this effort.

The meeting adjourned at 9:40AM.